



## Addenbrooke House Ironmasters Way Telford TF3 4NT

## **Annual Scrutiny Report 2018/19**

Foreword	2
What is Scrutiny?	3
Who carries out scrutiny work?	3
How is scrutiny work carried out?	3
How do we monitor the effectiveness of scrutiny?	4
Scrutiny Management Board	5
Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee	6
Customer, Community & Partnership Scrutiny Committee	7
Finance & Enterprise Scrutiny Committee	9
Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee	11
Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee	12
Looking Ahead	
Contacts	

#### **Foreword**



The Annual Report provides an important opportunity to look back and reflect over the last year. Over the following pages, each of the 2018/19 Scrutiny Chairs have provided details of the work of their Scrutiny Committee. This includes descriptions of Scrutiny Committees holding decision makers to account, Members reviewing topics at their regular meetings as well as in-depth work that has taken place over a series of meetings.

It has been a particularly momentous year for Scrutiny, as years of work on the NHS Future Fit programme culminated in the disappointing decision of the Joint CCG Board to support Royal Shrewsbury Hospital as the preferred location for the county's only A&E department. Councillor Burford, at the time co-Chair of the Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee, subsequently brought a motion to Full Council to refer the decision to the Secretary of State.

I am personally very pleased to note the reinvigoration of the West Midlands Scrutiny Network, a regional forum for Scrutiny Members and Officers to meet to share knowledge and best practice. As the Network grows, it is hoped to provide an online community as well as quarterly meetings. I appreciate that resources are somewhat pressed and our daytime commitments are varied but I would encourage Scrutiny Members to participate in both the physical and virtual aspects of this valuable forum.

Looking ahead, 2019/20 has already seen some changes to Scrutiny as new Committees were established at Annual Council, with some new Members appointed as Chairs and Committee Members. Over the year, experienced and new members will be working together to develop their scrutiny role and look at a wide range of issues to support the Council's 4 Year Plan. Recognising the severity of budget cuts means that resources are precious and it is more important than ever that scrutiny is focused on key areas to add value with every piece of work carried out.

Finally, I would like to express my thanks to all those who participated in Scrutiny during 2018/19: Committee Members, Cabinet Members being held to account, and Officers or other individuals attending to provide evidence or information in relation to one of our scrutiny topics. Your input, as always, is invaluable and has been much appreciated. Special thanks go to those elected Members of the Scrutiny Assembly who have not returned for the 2019/20 municipal year – we wish you all well in your future endeavours!

Councillor Derek White Lead Scrutiny Member 2019/20

## What is Scrutiny?

Scrutiny acts as a check and balance to ensure decision making in local government is democratic, effective and transparent. Local authorities with a Cabinet system – where a relatively small number of elected members are responsible for day-to-day decision making – must have a scrutiny function. Scrutiny is a way for elected members who are not on the Cabinet to have a greater influence in policy decisions and the work of the Council.

There are four nationally accepted principles set out by the Centre for Public Scrutiny:

- Providing "critical friend" challenge
- Reflecting the voice and concerns of the public
- Taking the lead and owning the scrutiny process
- Making an impact on the delivery of public services

## Who carries out scrutiny work?

Scrutiny is carried out by elected members who are not on the Council's Cabinet and members of the public co-opted for expertise in a particular area or to represent certain groups. They sit on Scrutiny Committees which carry out scrutiny work. The committees reflect the overall political balance of the Council.

In 2018/19 Telford & Wrekin had five scrutiny committees:

- Scrutiny Management Board
- Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee
- Customer, Community & Partnership Scrutiny Committee
- Finance & Enterprise Scrutiny Committee
- Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee certain members of this committee also sit on the Shropshire and Telford & Wrekin Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee.

## How is scrutiny work carried out?

Scrutiny is can be carried out in many different ways.

The Scrutiny Management Board oversees work programming and the way that scrutiny is resourced.

The Scrutiny Committees carry out the majority of scrutiny work. This usually involves reviewing services or policies at Scrutiny Committee meetings. A review can be a one-off item discussed at a meeting or may be considered in detail over a series of meetings. Reviews may involve discussions with Cabinet members, officers at the Council, managers and officers from other organisations, organisations providing a service, service users or members of the public – whoever may be relevant to the topic being discussed.

At the end of a review the committee may make recommendations where they think things could be improved. Where possible the Scrutiny Committees meet in public but scrutiny members can also hold working group meetings to gather evidence for a review.

#### How do we monitor the effectiveness of scrutiny?

The priority for any piece of scrutiny work is that it has an impact and makes a difference for local people. There are many ways that scrutiny can make a difference – some are easier to measure than others. Some of the commonly used measures of effective scrutiny work are listed below but sometimes scrutiny can make a difference simply by raising an issue for public debate.

- Holding the Executive to account questioning Cabinet members in public about their policies and actions helps ensure decision making is open and transparent. Many people argue this is an end in itself.
- Recommendations to Cabinet a common measure of the impact of scrutiny work is the number of recommendations made to and accepted by Cabinet. The majority of scrutiny recommendations in the past have been accepted.
- Recommendations to external organisations there are certain
  organisations with a statutory duty to respond to scrutiny but they do not have
  to accept scrutiny recommendations. Our approach is to engage partners
  positively in a scrutiny review so that recommendations are relevant, realistic
  and more likely to be acted on.
- **Policy development** examples include examining draft policies to consider the implications for local people and suggesting improvements, or giving feedback as part of a consultation on a proposed new policy or policy change.
- Holding health service commissioners and providers to account
- Monitoring performance of health services

The number of meetings provides an indication of how resources were committed to scrutiny over the year.

## **Scrutiny Management Board**

2018/19 Members: Councillors Nathan England (Chair), Stephen Bentley, Andy Burford, Angela McClements, Gilly Reynolds, Peter Scott and Jacqui Seymour



The Scrutiny Management Board has overall responsibility for co-ordinating and monitoring the delivery of the Scrutiny Work Programme and for allocating resources between the Scrutiny Committees so that the workload is managed effectively.

This year, the Scrutiny Management Board undertook our usual work programming session at the start of the year and also received several suggestions in-year. It is always pleasing when the public and our partners engage with scrutiny and offer suggestions to shape our work

programme.

We also engaged with the newly invigorated West Midlands Scrutiny Network to feed in views to the government's consultation for new scrutiny guidance.

#### Call-In

Call-in is a way for scrutiny members to examine a decision taken by Cabinet, or by officers under delegated authority, before the decision is implemented. The rules for calling in decisions are set out in the Council's Constitution and in the Scrutiny Handbook. There were no call-in requests to the Scrutiny Management Board during 2018/19.

## **Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee**

2018/19 Members: Councillors Angela McClements (Chair), Steve Barnes, Mark Boylan, Liz Clare, Joy Francis, Jayne Greenaway, Kevin Guy, Janice Jones and Jane Pinter

Co-Optees: Mrs C Healy, Mrs S Fikeis, Mrs L Fowler, Mrs C Morgan, and Mrs M Ward

The Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee's role is to scrutinise and monitor the planning and performance of the Council's services to children and young people and the Council's Corporate Parenting role.

In 2018/19 the Committee held three formal meetings and some of the highlights of our work are set out below.

#### **Education Attainment**

The Committee met with the Assistant Director: Education & Corporate Parenting to receive the most recent data on

educational attainment in the Borough. We engaged in a robust challenge of the results with a question and answer session.

#### **Telford & Wrekin Safeguarding Children Board Annual Report**

The Committee met with the Chair of the Safeguarding Children Board to receive the annual report. The Committee were particularly encouraged by the introduction of School Safeguarding Boards and recommended all schools without a dedicated safeguarding board have safeguarding as a standing item on their School Council agenda.

#### **Review of the Young Carers Service**

The Committee completed a review on the service offered to Young Carers in the Borough. During the course of this review, the Committee met with Council and external officers involved in the service and a young carer attended a scrutiny committee to share her experiences of being a young carer. The Committee made several recommendations which will be presented to Cabinet early in 2019/20.

# Customer, Community & Partnership Scrutiny Committee

2018/19 Members: Councillors Gilly Reynolds (Chair), Clive Mason, Leon Murray, Stephen Reynolds, Jacqui Seymour, Barry Tillotson and Karen Tomlinson. Co-optee: Mr D Johnson



The role of the Customer, Community & Partnership Scrutiny Committee is wide ranging, covering a number of key areas relating to the development of Telford & Wrekin as a Cooperative Council, the planning, delivery and performance of services provided to local communities, issues relating to how the Council works with partner organisations, housing, homelessness, transport and highways, regeneration, waste and recycling, customer services, community engagement, welfare reform, enforcement. The Committee is also the designated body for scrutiny of the Safer, Stronger Communities Partnership and of Flood and Water

Management.

In 2018/19 the Committee held three formal meetings and some of the highlights of our work are set out below. The Committee has also engaged with the Finance & Enterprise Scrutiny Committee to conduct a review of Civil Parking Enforcement.

#### **Community Safety Partnership**

As part of the Committee's statutory powers and following approval of the Safer Telford and Wrekin Strategy 2017-19 by Full Council early in 2018, the Committee invited Superintendent Tom Harding, the Chair of the Community Safety Partnership, to provide an overview of the Strategy. Members engaged thoroughly with the topic, asking a number of questions. No recommendations were made.

#### **Tackling Vehicle Damage**

Following a suggestion from a Member of the Public, the Committee decided to consider this issue under Scrutiny's Crime & Disorder Reduction powers. Supt Tom Harding, Chair of the Community Safety Partnership, and Mr Adam Matthews, Shropshire Fire & Rescue Service, were invited to engage with Scrutiny to provide further information. Supt Harding and Mr Matthews were able to provide reassuring reports and, following robust questioning, it was decided that no further scrutiny was required at this time.

#### **Third Party Engagement**

This item had been added to our work programme in 2017/18 following a suggestion from one of the Council's partner agencies. This was a very large topic so some time had been taken to consider how to scope the topic in a way

which would enable members to consider how to move the proposed review forward. An initial evidence gathering took place when a broad view was provided of the subject matter. Scrutiny was impressed to see that partnership working was embedded in everything the Council did and a clear process for engagement with partners and the community was in place. Overall Scrutiny recognised that engagement with people who were directly affected by issues was good but that communication with harder to engage groups could be improved. We also received an update report on new projects and budget consultation which was circulated in January 2019. No further indepth scrutiny on this topic is planned.

#### **Grounds Cleansing & Maintenance Contract**

The Committee engaged in monitoring of this contract, receiving updates at key stages in a comprehensive procurement process.

#### **Highways Contract**

The Committee received an update on another comprehensive procurement process and appointment of a new provider.

## Finance & Enterprise Scrutiny Committee

2018/19 Members: Councillors Nathan England (Chair), Stephen Bentley, Nigel Dugmore, Kuldip Sahota, Rob Sloan, Charles Smith and Dave Wright. Co-optees: Mrs C Mason-Morris and Mr R Williams



The main role of the Finance and Enterprise Scrutiny Committee is as a consultee for the Cabinet's budget proposals. However, our remit also covers oversight of the service and financial performance of Council services, income generation and how the Council is promoting economic growth in the local economy.

In 2018/19 we held three meetings and some of the highlights of our work are set out below.

#### **Civil Parking Enforcement (CPE)**

Our in-depth review of CPE began in 2016/17 following a Motion referred by Council regarding the transfer of powers from the Police to the Local Authority for enforcing parking contraventions, moving from a criminal matter to a civil matter. During the course of the review, the Committee worked with the Customer, Community & Partnership Scrutiny Committee to receive evidence in the form of financial modelling data from Council Officers and the views and insights of a number of parties. Following successful negotiation by the Leader with the Police and Crime Commissioner, an increase in the financial support available to support the implementation of CPE was secured and the Cabinet resolved to commence with the business case process to apply to the Department of Transport (DfT) to adopt CPE Powers. Scrutiny received a report of the public consultation which had taken place and were also advised that the Council would seek to adopt a Neighbourhood Warden/Enforcement Officer model whereby an officer would have parking enforcement powers alongside other powers to address anti-social behaviour such as fly tipping, abandoned vehicles, and other environmental crime. The Committee received a number of reassurances regarding the benchmarking data which had informed modelling and the funding position. Scrutiny was unanimously in support of the Council making the application without delay. It was agreed that Scrutiny should monitor the scheme two years post-implementation.

#### Service & Financial Planning 2019/20 to 2021/22

The Committee held two meetings on 8 January and 21 January 2019 to scrutinise the draft budget strategy agreed by Cabinet for consultation on 3 January 2019. The main opposition group did not submit an alternative budget proposal. The general consensus of the Committee was to support the administration's budget approach in light of the lack of clarity around funding for 2020-21 and beyond. The Committee made observations and expressed concern around government funding for Public Health and Adult Care. We recommended that Cabinet reinvigorate the lobby to the Office for National Statistics with regard to the population undercount and supported the intention to

make maximum use of the powers conferred by the Rating (Property in Common Occupation) and Council Tax (Empty Dwellings) Act 2018 to encourage owners of properties that have been empty for a long time to bring them back in to use. Our full report is included in the final report considered by Council on 28 February 2019.

## **Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee**

2018/19 Members: Councillors Andy Burford (Chair), Mark Boylan, Stephen Burrell,

Liz Clare, Nigel Dugmore, Veronica Fletcher, Leon Murray, Tim Nelson and Rob Sloan

2018/19 Co-optees: Mrs J Gulliver, Mrs C Henniker, Mrs H Knight and Mr D Saunders



The Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee scrutinises and monitors the planning and performance of the Council's adult social care services and health service matters. Some Members of the Committee are also appointed to work jointly with colleagues from Shropshire Council to scrutinise health issues that impact on the wider health economy in Shropshire, Telford & Wrekin.

In 2018/19 we held four Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee meetings and some of the highlights of our work are set out below.

#### **Unmet Needs**

In partnership with Telford & Wrekin Healthwatch, the Committee undertook a review into how local residents were able to access local adult care and support services. During the course of the review, a survey was undertaken which included service users and residents who had not used the service. A workshop event was also held with local voluntary and community sector organisations to hear their views. The Committee commended the report and recommended that further, in depth scrutiny was required in this area.

#### Adult Care Performance, Budget & Savings & Cost Improvement Plan

The Committee received regular updates on Adult Care Performance throughout the year, focusing on various areas, such as older people and adults with learning disabilities. We received demonstrations on assistive technology gadgets that can be used to support residents and were pleased to hear of the creation of a 'Smart House' to showcase what is available.

#### **Neighbourhood Working**

The Committee were informed about the Neighhourhood Working Programme in the Borough. We were pleased to hear about many of the volunteer schemes in place and the impact this is having for residents. We have also investigated GPs perspectives on Neighbourhood Working and have met with several local GPs to discuss their experiences.

## Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee

2018/19 Members: Councillors Andy Burford (Co-Chair), Stephen Burrell and Rob Sloan

2018/19 Co-Optees: Mrs C Henniker, Mrs H Knight and Mr D Saunders



The Joint Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee is appointed where a relevant NHS body consults more than one local authority about substantial reconfiguration proposals. In respect of the Future Fit Programme for reconfiguration of Shrewsbury and Telford Hospital NHS Trust's (SATH's) provision of "safe and sustainable patient services specifically in emergency and critical care", this Council has delegated its health scrutiny function to a mandatory joint health scrutiny committee in conjunction with Shropshire Council (the JHOSC).

The Committee met seven times in 2018/19, and some of the highlights of the work we have carried out with colleagues at Shropshire Council are set out below.

#### **Future Fit Programme**

We have continued to regularly scrutinse the Future Fit proposals. The public consultation period, where the public was asked to comment on the CCGs preferred option; the Emergency Site to be based at the Royal Shrewsbury Hospital and the Planned Care Site be based at the Princess Royal Hospital, took place between 30 May and 11 September 2018. During the course of the public consultation, we heard from local residents and representatives from the voluntary and community sector on their experiences of the consultation. We also heard evidence from West Midlands Ambulance Service and the Travel and Transport Group Chair. We were advised that the public Consultation responses did not contain any information that would change the view of the programme board, although we were not presented with the Full Business Case. We were unable to agree recommendations with our colleagues from Shropshire Council, however, we were able to write to the programme board to advise them of our concerns. The CCGs decided to make no changes to their recommendation that the Emergency Site be based at the Royal Shrewsbury Hospital and the Planned Care Site be based at the Princess Royal Hospital. In February 2019, The Co-Chair of the Committee proposed a motion at the Full Council meeting to refer the decision to the Secretary of State for review, which was unanimously agreed by Full Council.

#### **Midwife Led Service Review**

The Committee received updates on the proposed new configuration of midwife led services across Shropshire, Telford and Wrekin. The Committee will continue to feed into the consultation as it progresses.

#### **CQC Enforcement Action - SaTH**

We heard from the Senior Officers at SaTH, as well as both Shropshire and Telford and Wrekin CCGs, on the CQC's decision to place the trust in special

measures.

#### **Maternity Services Review**

We have received updates on the ongoing review into SaTH's maternity services. We have been informed that the investigation is progressing and have requested that the report is presented to the Committee once it has been published.

#### **Reconfiguration of Ophthalmology Services**

The Committee received the initial proposals for the reconfiguration of Ophthalmology Services at SaTH. We provided our initial responses to the proposals and it was decided that the topic would return to Scrutiny following consultation with service users and stakeholders.

We have also scrutinised the following services and topics:

- Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services
- Community Learning Disabilities Health Services in Shropshire, Telford and Wrekin
- Maternity Learning
- Urgent Treatment Centres
- Winter Plan

## **Looking Ahead**

Early in each calendar year the Scrutiny Management Board makes contact with Councillors and the Council's key partners to seek suggestions for the topics that Scrutiny should consider over the next municipal year.

The Scrutiny Management Board will receive the suggestions that have been put forward and agree which issues meet the Scrutiny criteria and should be prioritised for the 2019/20 work programme and recommended to the Scrutiny Committees for consideration.

A list of the prioritised suggestions and issues will be available from: <a href="http://www.telford.gov.uk/info/20237/scrutiny/371/scrutiny\_work\_programme">http://www.telford.gov.uk/info/20237/scrutiny/371/scrutiny\_work\_programme</a>

## Contacts

To find out more about Scrutiny visit: <a href="www.telford.gov.uk/scrutiny">www.telford.gov.uk/scrutiny</a>

To find meeting dates and agendas for scrutiny meetings visit: <a href="https://www.telford.gov.uk/meetings">www.telford.gov.uk/meetings</a> or call the Democratic & Scrutiny Services Team on 01952 383215.

If you would like to contact a member of the Democratic & Scrutiny Services Team, our contact details are below:

Anthea Lowe Governance & Legal Services Manager and Deputy Monitoring Officer 01952 383233 anthea.lowe@telford.gov.uk

Deborah Moseley Democratic & Scrutiny Services Team Leader 01952 383215 deborah.moseley@telford.gov.uk

General Enquiries scrutiny@telford.gov.uk